

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ט – העור והרוטב

דף קכח – Daf 128

1. *Machlokes* about אוחז בקטן וגדול עולה עמו

On the previous Daf, Rebbe Meir said that the blood of a *shechted* animal effects הכשר for its dangling אבר, even without the blood touching the אבר itself, but Rebbe Shimon disagrees. This *machlokes* is explained in six ways. Abaye says they argue about עמו גדול עולה ואין בקטן – a partially divided item where, if *one holds* and lifts *the smaller part*, *the larger part does not come up with it*, but breaks away. Rebbe Meir holds כמורה – [the smaller part] *is still considered like one with [the larger part]*. Therefore, the אבר is still considered part of the animal regarding הכשר. Rebbe Shimon holds it is considered separate. Rebbe Yochanan asks that this contradicts another ruling of Rebbe Meir regarding אוכל שנפרס – *food [of terumah] which broke* but remains partially attached. Rebbe Meir says עמו גדול עולה ואין בקטן – *if one can hold and lift the smaller part and the larger part will come up with it*, they are considered one item, and a טבול יום who touches the smaller part is *metamei* the larger part. Rebbe Yochanan concluded: מוחלפת השיטה – [Rebbe Meir's] *opinion is reversed* here. Although one might argue that a טבול יום is more lenient, Rebbe Yochanan's point was according to Rebbe, who equates a טבול יום with ordinary *tumah*.

2. Can a live animal serve as a יד for a dangling אבר?

Rabbah asked: ביהמה בחייה מהו שתעשה יד לאבר – *can a living animal become a יד for a dangling limb*? The אבר can become susceptible to food *tumah*, but the animal itself is not. If *tumah* touches the animal, will the אבר become *tamei*? This question is left unresolved. Amoraim ask four additional questions about whether specific items which are not themselves susceptible to *tumah* can serve as a יד. For example, if a cucumber is planted in a non-perforated pot, Rebbe Shimon says that although the leaves inside the pot are impervious to *tumah*, the leaves which protrude outside the pot are susceptible to *tumah*. Abaye asked whether the inside leaves can serve as a יד for the outside leaves. This question, as well as the three which follow, remains unresolved.

3. בשר הפורש מן החי is not *metamei*

The Mishnah taught that after an animal dies, its dangling אבר is *tamei* as אבר מן החי, but not as נבילה. The Gemara explains that the practical difference concerns בשר which separates from the אבר: בשר which separates from אבר מן החי is not *metamei*, whereas בשר from נבילה *is metamei*. We derive that אבר מן החי is *metamei* from וחי ימות מן – *and if there shall die "from" an animal*, implying that even part of an animal (אבר) is *metamei*. Tannaim exclude אבר מן החי from being *metamei* in three ways from this *passuk*: Rebbe Yose HaGlili says ממה מיתה שאינה עושה – *just as death does not generate a replacement*, so too anything severed from a live animal is only *metamei* if it does not generate a replacement (i.e., אבר). This excludes בשר, which can regenerate. Rebbe Akiva says that just as an animal has גידים ועצמות – *sinews and bones*, so too only something with sinews and bones which separates from a live animal is *metamei*, excluding בשר. They therefore disagree whether the כליא – *kidney* and גיב שפתים – *upper lip* are *metamei* (they cannot regenerate, but lack עצמות). Rebbe says that only אבר containing בשר, גידין, and עצמות is *metamei*, thus excluding the ארכובה – *lower leg joint*, which lacks flesh.

Siman – One Hundred Strong Men

At the **One Hundred Strong Men** contest where one strong man **lifted the dangling leg of a *shechted* cow to see if the rest of cow would come up with it regarding הכשר**, another strong man tried to attach a big hand sticker onto a live cow to indicate **the cow may be יד for its dangling limb**, next to where some of the **cow's severed flesh was placed that was not *metamei***.

DAF 128 | דף קכח

100 Strong Men



At the **One Hundred Strong Men** contest where one strong man lifted the dangling leg of a *shechted* cow to see if the rest of cow would come up with it regarding הכשר, another **strong man** tried to attach a big hand sticker onto a live cow to indicate the cow may be יד for its dangling limb, next to where some of the cow's severed flesh was placed that was not *metamei*.

3 things to remember

1. **Machlokes** about אווחז בקטן וגדול עולה עמו
2. Can a live animal serve as a יד for a dangling אבר?
3. בשר הפורש מן החי is not *metamei*

